osgoode hall law journal

VOLUME 11
1973

Published by
OSGOODE HALL LAW SCHOOL OF YORK UNIVERSITY

Printed by
IMPERIAL PRESS LIMITED
548 KING STREET WEST
TORONTO, ONTARIO

OSGOODE HALL LAW JOURNAL

BOARD OF EDITORS

ARTHUR HALADNER, B.A., LL.B. (Editor-in-Chief)
RICHARD MCIVOR, B.A., M.A., LL.B.
BLAKE MURRAY, LL.B.
JAY SWARTZ, B.A., LL.B.
ERIC SWITZER, LL.B.

Secretary

SALLY LAYTON

Faculty Advisors

PAUL C. WEILER, B.A., M.A., LL.B., LL.M.
JACOB S. ZIEGEL, LL.B., LL.M., Ph.D.

Journal Staff

JENNIFER BANKIER
ANNE BARRETT
STEVE DUGGAN
MICHAEL HERMAN
KENNETH KAGAN
MICHAEL KESTENBERG
RENE LARSON
PAUL LOWRY
DOUGLAS MILLSTONE

INDEX

TITLES OF LEADING ARTICLES

Page

THE ADMISSIBILITY OF BUSINESS RECORDS: A PARTIAL METAMORPHOSIS
by S. N. Lederman 373

ARE THERE CONSTITUTIONALLY GUARANTEED LANGUAGE RIGHTS IN CRIMINAL CODE PROCEEDINGS?
by L. Katz 545

CANADIAN CONSUMER REPORTING LEGISLATION: TRENDS AND PROBLEMS
by J. S. Ziegel 503

CLASS ACTIONS IN CANADA
by J. A. Kazanjian 397

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST — A TRAP FOR UNWARY POLITICIANS
by I. M. Rogers 537

CONSENT TO TREATMENT
by L. E. Rozovsky 103

THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF YUGOSLAVIA IN THE PROTECTION OF BASIC HUMAN RIGHTS
by D. Kulic 275

THE CONTROL OF LIFE: UNEXAMINED LAW AND LIFE WORTH LIVING
by B. Starkman 175

COUNSEL, CLIENTS AND COMMUNITY
by H. W. Arthurs 437

DISTRIBUTION ON INTESTACY IN ONTARIO
by P. W. Hogg 479

OF DOCTORS, HOSPITALS AND LIMITATIONS, "THE PATIENT'S DILEMMA"
by J. P. S. McLaren 85

DOCTORS, SAMARITANS AND THE ACCIDENT VICTIM
by R. J. Gray and G. S. Sharpe 1

THE EXERCISE OF DIRECTORS' POWERS: — THE BATTLE OF AFTON MINES
by F. Iacobucci 353

THE FEDERAL COURT OF APPEAL
by W. R. Jackett 253

HEALTH POLICY AND THE LAW IN SENEGAL
by F. G. Snyder 127

THE MALPRACTICE SUIT: IS IT NEEDED?
by D. Kretzmer 55

MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY REGIMES: YESTERDAY, TODAY, AND TOMORROW
by H. R. Hahlo 455

THE MEDICAL PROFESSION AND THE ADVERSARY PROCESS
by E. L. Haines 40

MINORS AND HEALTH CARE: THE AGE OF CONSENT
by W. Wadlington 115

THE NEGLIGENT DOCTOR
by A. M. Linden 31

PSYCHIATRY AND THE LAW
by R. E. Turner 157

THE SILENT DOCTOR v. THE DUTY TO SPEAK
by S. G. M. Grange 81

THE SUPREME COURT OF CANADA AND ADMINISTRATIVE LAW, 1949-1971
by P. W. Hogg 187

THE SUPREME COURT OF CANADA AND CANADIAN FEDERALISM
by P. C. Weiler 225

TOWARD CANADIAN IDENTITY — THE SIGNIFICANCE OF FOREIGN INVESTMENT
by I. Wahn 517

AUTHORS OF LEADING ARTICLES

ARTHURS, H. W.
Counsel, Clients and Community 437

GRANGE, S. G. M.
The Silent Doctor v. The Duty to Speak 81

GRAY, R. J.
Doctors, Samaritans and the Accident Victim
by R. J. Gray and G. S. Sharpe 1

HAHLO, H. R.
Matrimonial Property Regimes: Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow 455

HAINES, E. L.
The Medical Profession and the Adversary Process 40

HOGG, P. W.
Distribution on Intestacy in Ontario 479

HOGG, P. W.
The Supreme Court of Canada and Administrative Law, 1949-1971 187

IACOBUCCI, F.
The Exercise of Directors' Powers: — The Battle Of Afton Mines 353

JACKETT, W. R.
The Federal Court of Appeal 253

KATZ, L.
Are There Constitutionally Guaranteed Language Rights in Criminal Code Proceedings? 545

KAZANJIAN, J. A.
Class Actions in Canada 397

KRETZMER, D.
The Malpractice Suit: Is it Needed? 55

KULIC, D.
The Constitutional Court of Yugoslavia in the Protection of Basic Human Rights 285

LEDERMAN, S. N.
The Admissibility of Business Records: A Partial Metamorphosis 373

LINDEN, A. M.
The Negligent Doctor 31

McLAREN, J. P. S.
Of Doctors, Hospitals and Limitations, "The Patient's Dilemma 85

ROGERS, I. M.
Conflicts of Interest — A Trap for Unwary Politicians 537

ROZOVSKY, L. E.
Consent to Treatment 103

SHARPE, G. S.
Doctors, Samaritans and the Accident Victim, by G. S. Sharpe and R. J. Gray 1

SNYDER, F. G.
Health Policy and the Law in Senegal 127

STARKMAN, B.
The Control of Life: Unexamined Law and Life Worth Living 175

TURNER, R. E.
Psychiatry and the Law 157

WADLINGTON, W.
Minors and Health Care: The Age of Consent 115

WAHN, I.
Toward Canadian Identity — The Significance of Foreign Investment 517

WEILER, P. C.
The Supreme Court of Canada and Canadian Federalism 225

ZIEGEL, J. S.
Canadian Consumer Reporting Legislation: Trends and Problems 503

NOTES AND COMMENTS

CULLITY, M. C.
Re McCreath 316

HOOPER, A.
Regina v. Graham 295

McRAE, D. M.
Le Gouvernement de la République Démocratique du Congo v. Venne 326

NATHAN, H. R.
Forfar v. The Township of East Gwillimbury 335

SHEARD, T.
Beament v. M. N. R. 341

SIM, D. F.
Home Juice Co. v. Orange Maison Ltée. 344

BOOK REVIEWS

(Reviewers name in brackets)

LINDEN, A. M.
Canadian Negligence Law, Toronto: Butterworths, 1972.
(J. G. Fleming) 349

MENDES DA COSTA, D.
Studies in Canadian Family Law, Toronto: Butterworths, 1972. (G. Parker) 552

SCACE, A. R. A.
The Income Tax Law of Canada, Toronto: The Law Society of Upper Canada, 1972 (M. L. O'Brien) 551

CASES CITED

(Case comments in heavy print)

A

Adair v. The New River Co. 406
Adderly v. Bremner 390, 391, 392
Alder v. Gaglardi 422, 428, 430
Anderson v. Chasney 33, 67
Ares v. Venner 384, 385, 386, 392
Ashtown Hardware Co. v. Singer 384
Arnott v. The College of Physicians and Surgeons of Saskatchewan 83
A. G. Canada v. Brent 212, 214
A. G. Manitoba v. The Manitoba Egg and Poultry Association 225, 230, 231, 232, 233, 241, 242, 248
A.G. Ontario v. Perry 321
Aynsley v. Toronto General Hospital 392

B

Bamber v. Bank of Nova Scotia 430
Bamford v. Bamford 370
Beatty v. Kozak 190, 199, 200, 207
Beaumont v. M.N.R. **341**
Bedford v. Ellis 413, 417, 419, 428
Beeching v. Lloyd 410, 411, 415, 416
Board of Health (Saltfleet Twshp.) v. Knapman 216, 218
Bonner v. Moran 118
Booth v. Toronto General Hospital 110
Bridge v. The Queen 212, 213
Bromley v. Williams 411
Brown v. Vermuden 402
Burns v. The Queen 325

C

Calgary Power Ltd. v. Copithorne 216, 217, 218
Canada Atlantic Rlwy. Co. v. Moxley 384
C.P.R. v. City of Calgary 385
Carnation Co. Ltd. v. The Quebec Agricultural Marketing Board 229, 230, 231, 232, 241
Chambers v. Bernasconi 379
Chancey v. May 405, 406
Chaput v. Romain 189, 199, 200
Chastain v. B.C. Hydro and Power Authority 426, 428, 431, 432, 433
City of London v. Richmond 404
City of Ottawa v. Boyd Builders Ltd. 210
City of Outremont v. Protestant School Trustees 212
City of Toronto v. Outdoor Neon Displays Ltd. 212
City of Verdun v. Sun Oil Co. 211, 212
Clark v. Wansborough 39
Cockburn v. Thompson 407
Commission du Salaire v. Bell Telephone Co. of Canada 246, 247
Conley v. Conley 377, 381, 391
Coughlin v. Ontario Highway Transport Board 248, 250
Cowan v. C.B.C. 427

D

DeLong v. The New Brunswick Teachers Federation 421, 422, 424
Dominion Telegraph Securities Ltd. v. M.N.R. 379
Drohan v. Sangamo Co. 421, 422, 424, 434, 435

E

Earl of Winchelsea v. Norcliff 499

F

Farnham v. Fingold 434, 435
Farrell v. Workmen's Compensation Board 205
Fine Foods of Canada v. Metcalfe Foods Ltd. 347
Flota Maritima Browning du Cuba S.A. v. Republic of Cuba 327, 329
Forfar v. The Twshp. of East Gwillimbury 335, 338, 339, 340
Foss v. Harbottle 359

G

Gartside v. I.R.C. 318, 324
Gloning v. Muller 92
Good v. Blewitt 406, 411
Gorkin (Adelman Estate) v. M.N.R. 320, 321, 322
Guay v. Lafleur 218, 219

H

Halushka v. University of Saskatchewan 66
Hoffman — La Roche Ltd. v. Delmar Chemical Ltd. 220, 221
Hogg v. Cramphorn Ltd. 367, 368
Hollinger Bus Lines Ltd. v. Ontario Labour Relations Board 195
Home Juice Co. v. Orange Maison Ltée. 344, 345, 346, 347
Home Oil Distribution Ltd. v. A. G. British Columbia 228, 230
Horn v. Sturm 389
Hunter v. Hanley 34

J

Jarvis v. Associated Medical Service Inc. 203
Jarvis v. International Nickel Ltd. 38
Jewison v. Hassard 33
John v. Reco 426
Johnson v. Lutz 389, 390, 391
Johnson v. Wellesley Hospital 32, 117
Johnston v. Hazer 382
Jones v. Garcia del Rio 410
Judge v. Muslim Society of Toronto, Inc. 422

K

King v. University of Saskatchewan 195
Kirmitz v. Merei 38

L

Lacey v. Laird 118, 119, 120
Lafremere v. Hospital Maisonneuve 109
Lamb v. Benoit 189, 200, 201
Le Gouvernement de la République Démocratique du Congo v. Venne 326, 330, 334
Lloyd v. Loaring 405
Lloyd v. Tench 497

M

Market and Company Ltd. v. The Knight Steamships Co. 412, 414, 417, 420, 422, 432, 433, 434
Martin v. Gibson 370
Masella v. Langlais 194
Massey v. Allen 378
Mayor of York v. Pilkington 403
McCormick v. Marcotte 36
McFadyen v. Harvie 33
McGillvray v. Shaw 377, 381
Mehr v. Law Society of Upper Canada 219, 221
Melton v. St. Louis Public Service Co. 391
Mercer v. Denne 381
Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. v. International Union of Operating Engineers 203
Metropolitan Toronto v. Village of Forest Hill 209
Meux v. Maltby 407, 414
Miller v. Ryerson 87, 90
Miranda v. Arizona 314
M.N.R. v. Cameron 343
M.N.R. v. H. Cox Estate 342
M.N.R. v. National Trust Co. (Wood Estate) 319, 320, 321, 326
Mulloy v. Hop Sang 109, 112
Myers v. Director of Public Prosecution 373, 382, 383, 384, 385

N

National Provincial Bank v. Ainsworth 472, 475
Newton v. Egmont 409
Northern Wood Preserves Ltd. v. Hall Corporation (Shipping) 1969 Ltd. 391

O

Omand v. Alberta Milling Co. 384
Ontario Fair Products Reference 229, 230
Otney v. United States 389

P

Palmer v. Hoffman 394
Palter Cap Company v. Great West Life Assurance Co. 375, 377
Penner v. Theobald 33
Pettitt v. Pettitt 473
Phillippon v. Legate 91
Phillips v. Ford Motor Company 51
Polini v. Gray 380
Price v. Torrington 381

Q

The Queen v. Leong Ba Chai 205
The Queen v. Randolf 198

R

R. v. Abramovitch 298
R. v. Hodd 296, 297, 299, 300, 301, 302, 309, 313
R. v. Pappin 306
R. v. Schama 298
229822 Realty Ltd. v. Reid 338
Re Brady Infants 394

Re Carter and Congram 336, 338, 339
Re Chodikoff 342, 343
Re Harrison 486
Re McCreath **316**
Re Redmond and Rothschild 337, 338, 339, 340
Re Twiggs Estate 486
Regina v. Graham **295**
Rex v. Baterman 31
Rex v. Sussex 47
Ridge v. Baldwin 217
Roncarelli v. Duplessis 189, 200
Rowlands v. De Vecchi 380

S

Silhouette Products Ltd. v. Prodon Industries Ltd. 347
Shannon v. Lower Mainland Dairy Products Board 228, 230
Shar v. Real Estate Board of Greater Vancouver 432
Smith and Rhuland v. The Queen 190, 207
Smith v. Blakey 379
Smith v. Cardiff Corporation 417, 418, 421, 426
Smith v. Central Asbestos Co. 100
Stanley v. Stanley 497

T

Taff Vale Rlwy. v. Amalgamated Society of Rlwy. Servants 419
Taylor v. Salmon 408
Teck Corporation Ltd. v. Millar 355, 361, 364, 367, 369, 371
Temperton v. Russell 419, 420
The Commissioners of Sewers v. Gellatly 416
The Henry Coxon 381
Toronto General Trusts Corporation (Hilder Estate) v. M.N.R. 321, 322
Toronto Newspaper Guild v. Global Printing Co. 202, 221
Town v. Archer 37, 92

U

University of Ceylon v. Fernando 221

V

Valen v. Langlois 548, 549
Vancouver General Hospital v. Fraser 36
Villeneuve v. Sisters of St. Joseph 110

W

Waffle v. Flynn 541
Walworth v. Holt 408
Warrick v. Queens College Oxford 410
Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society v. A. G. Canada 419
Wilson v. Swanson 32, 35
Wiswell v. Metropolitan Corporation of Greater Winnipeg 195, 217

Y

Yourits v. St. Francis Hospital and School of Nursing, Inc. 117, 118

Z

Zinkler v. Robertson 37

SUBJECT MATTER INDEX

A

Accident victims 1
Afton Mines 353
Administrative Law 187
Adversary Process 41

B

Ball, George 521
Blood Relatives 491
B.N.A. Act (s. 133) 545
Business Records 373

C

Capacity (Consent) 110
Class Actions 397
Collateral Relatives 490, 495
Colonial Health Policy 130
Competition Act 452
Conflict of Interest 537
Consanguinity Table 491
Consent 103, 115
Conspiracy of Silence 81
Constitutional Law (Yugoslavian) 275
Consumer Reporting Legislation 507
Contributory Negligence 43
Coroner's Inquest 73
Credit (Consumers') 503
Curtesy 484

D

Descriptive (Trade Marks) 344
Devolution of Estates Act 478
Directors' Powers 353
Discretionary Action 206
Doctors 1, 31, 41, 55, 81, 83, 103
Dower 463, 483
Dying Declarations 376

E

Escheats Act 500
Estate Freezing 341
Estate Planning 341
Eugenics 181
Exchequer Court 253
Exculpatory Statements 295
Experiments (Medical) 112
Expropriations 270

F

Family Court 165
Farm Products Marketing Act 226

Federal Court of Appeal 253
Federalism 225
Foreign Investment 519
Foreign Investment Review Act 519
Freedom of Movement 280

G
Genovese, (Ruth, Kitty) 16, 41
German Law 44
Gift Tax Act 341
Good Samaritan Statute 3, 5

H
Hamilton Psychiatric Hospital 167
Hearsay 373
Human Rights (Yugoslavian) 275

I
Inquisitorial System 44
Insanity 160
International Law 326
Interns 36
Intestacy 479

J
Jehovah's Witnesses 189, 199, 419
Judicial Review 187

L
Language Rights 545
Lay Advocates 446
Legal Profession 437
Legitimacy 490
Limitation Act 91
Limitation Periods (Medical) 85
London Psychiatric Hospital 168
Loss Insurance 52

M
Malpractice 1, 31, 41, 55, 85
Matrimonial Property 455
Medical Act 88
Military Dependence 525
McNaghten Rules 161
Municipal Act 537
Municipal Conflicts of Interest Act 543

N
Negligent Doctors 31
No-Fault Insurance 52

O
Ontario Evidence Act 387

P

Penetang Mental Health Centre 167
Privative Clauses 186
Privilege 82, 453, 515
Prostitution 152
Psychiatry 157
Public Health Law 127

R

Representation 493
Res Gestae 304, 310

S

Senegal 127
Sovereign Immunity 326
Specialization (Lawyers) 49
Standard of Care 31
Statistics (S.C.C.) 285
Sterilization 177
Subdivisions 335
Succession Duty 316
Succession Duty Act 316
Supreme Court of Canada 187, 225, 285

W

Williston Report 175

Y

Yugoslavian Law (Constitutional) 275